STATE OF ARIZONA

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

CIVIL RIGHTS DIVISION

Joanna Maung obo Sonny Maung and)
Isabela Choi,) CRD NO. PCRD-2018-0346
)
Complainant,) CONCILIATION AGREEMENT
v.) (Pre-finding)

Bayless Health Care,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Respondent.

Agreement is made between the Civil This Division of the Arizona Attorney General's Office, (hereinafter "the Division"); Joanna Maung, Sonny Maung and Isabela Choi, (hereinafter "Complainants"); and Bayless Health Care, corporation, d/b/a Bayless Integrated Healthcare, Arizona (hereinafter "Respondent"). A complaint of discrimination (CRD Case Number PCRD-2018-0346), based on disability by a public filed by Complainants against accommodation, having been Respondent with the Division pursuant to the Arizonans with Disabilities Act (AzDA), A.R.S. § 41-1492 et seq., the parties have conferred and hereby voluntarily agree to and do resolve the issues in the complaint on the following terms:

Τ

This Agreement will not constitute or evidence an admission by the parties that an act or practice made unlawful by A.R.S. § 41-1492 et seq. occurred, nor should any such inference be drawn.

Jub

.

Subject to the fulfillment by Respondent of each of the obligations set forth in this Agreement, the Division agrees to close complaint CRD No. PCRD-2018-0346 and Complainants agree to waive or release all claims against Respondent in any forum with respect to the matters that were alleged in the charge of discrimination numbered CRD No. PCRD-2018-0346.

III

The Division's participation in this Agreement does not reflect any judgment by the Division as to the merits of complaint CRD No. PCRD-02018-0346. The Division does not waive its right to process any other complaint against Respondent. Except as otherwise provided in this Agreement, the Division does waive its right to file a Divisional complaint against Respondent relating to the matters which were alleged in the complaint in CRD No. PCRD-2018-0346. The Division also has the right to make reasonable inquiry and investigation regarding compliance with this Agreement. The Division further has the right to enforce the Agreement through all available means, including but not limited to, the institution of litigation in any court with jurisdiction should Respondent fail to comply with any of the terms of this Agreement.

IV

1. Examples of "Auxiliary Aids and Services" include Qualified Interpreters provided either in-person or through

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Video Remote Interpreting ("VRI") services; note takers; realtime computer-aided transcription services; written materials; written notes; telephone handset amplifiers; of exchange listening devices; assistive listening systems; assistive hearing aids; closed caption telephones compatible with including real-time and closed captioning, decoders; open captioning; voice, text, and video-based telecommunications products and systems, including text telephones videophones, and captioned telephones, or equally effective telecommunications devices; videotext displays; accessible other effective electronic and information technology; or methods of making aurally delivered information available to individuals who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing.

- The term "Qualified Interpreter" means an interpreter 2. who, via VRI service or an in-person appearance, is able to accurately, impartially, interpret effectively, and receptively and expressively, using any necessary specialized vocabulary. Qualified Interpreters include, for example, sign language interpreters, oral transliterators, and cued-language For purposes of this Agreement, a Qualified transliterators. Interpreter must be knowledgeable with medical terminology.
- The term "Patient" shall be broadly construed to 3. individual seeking include any who is access to. or participating in, the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, or accommodations of Respondent.

The term "Companion" means a person who is Deaf or 4. Hard of Hearing, as defined herein, and is a family member, friend, or associate of an individual seeking access to, or participating in, the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, or accommodations of Respondent, who, along with such individual, is an appropriate person with whom Respondent

1

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

should communicate.

Respondent shall provide appropriate Auxiliary Aids including in-person Qualified Interpreters or and Services, Qualified Interpreters available through VRI, where such aids and services are necessary to ensure effective communication with Patients and Companions who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 41-1492.02(A) and (G)(3), Respondent shall provide Patients and Companions who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing with the full and equal enjoyment of the services, privileges, facilities, advantages, and accommodations of Respondent as required by this Agreement and Arizona and federal law.

VI

Respondent shall equal services, not deny accommodations, or other opportunities to any individual because of the known relationship of that person with someone who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing. See A.R.S. § 41-1492.02(A).

VII

Respondent agrees that it and its agents will not engage in any discrimination or retaliation of any kind against

AZDA JMB

Complainants or against any other person because he/she has opposed any practice reasonably believed by him/her to be unlawful under the Arizonans with Disabilities Act (AzDA), A.R.S. §41-1492 et seq., or because he/she has filed a complaint, given testimony or assistance, or participated in any manner in any investigation or proceeding under the Arizonans with Disabilities Act.

VIII

- 1. Within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this Agreement, Respondent shall modify its existing policy prohibiting discrimination based on an individual's disability.
- 2. Consistent with A.R.S. § 41-1492.02(G)(3), Respondent shall provide Patients and their Companions who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing any appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services that are necessary for effective communication after making the assessment described in paragraphs VIII(3), VIII(4), VIII(5) and VIII(6) of this Agreement. Appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services shall be provided as soon as practicable without compromising patient care.
- 3. The determination of appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services, and the timing, duration, and frequency with which they will be provided, shall be made by Respondent in consultation with the Patient or Companion with a disability. The assessment made by Respondent shall be made regardless of how a Patient or their Companion is paying for Respondent's care and will take into account all relevant facts and

4

7

9 10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

circumstances, including the individual's communication skills and knowledge, and the nature and complexity of the communication at issue.

- The determination of which appropriate Auxiliary Aids 4. and the timing, duration, and Services are necessary, frequency with which they will be provided, must be made (a) at the time an appointment is scheduled for the Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing or, (b) on the arrival of the Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing at place of business, whichever is the Respondent's identified need for Auxiliary Aids and Services. In the event that the initial form of communication is not effective or circumstances change, Respondent's personnel shall reassess which appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services, in consultation with the person with a disability, are necessary for effective communication, and provide such appropriate Auxiliary Aids or Services based on the reassessment.
 - 5. In-person Qualified Interpreters.
 - Although the determination of whether and what Α. Auxiliary Aids and Service is appropriate to a given situation is generally up to Respondent as informed by its assessment and the input or request of the Patient or Companion as part of a thorough evaluation οf the Patient or Companion's communication needs. some circumstances may raise a rebuttable presumption

AZDA

that Respondent is required to provide an inperson Qualified Interpreter to Patients Companions who rely upon such types of communications, in effectively order to communicate with those Patients or Companions. Such circumstances typically arise when information to be communicated is particularly lengthy. Such circumstances complex include, but are not limited to:

- i. Discussing a patient's symptoms for any diagnostic purpose, and discussing medical and psychological conditions, medications, and medical and psychological history;
- ii. Explaining medical and psychological
 conditions, treatment options, tests,
 medications, surgery, and other procedures;
- iii. Providing a diagnosis or recommendation for treatment;
- iv. Communications immediately preceding,
 during, and immediately after complex
 medical or psychological procedures;
- v. Obtaining informed consent for treatment;
- vi. Providing instructions for medications, post-treatment activities, and follow-up treatments;

21

22

23 24

25

26

- vii. Providing mental health services, including group or individual counseling for patients and family members; or
- viii. Discussing powers of attorney , living
 wills and/or complex billing, and insurance
 matters.
- the circumstances outlined in paragraphs В. VIII(5)(A)(i)-(viii) above, in order to comply provisions of this Agreement, the Respondent must complete a thorough evaluation Patient or Companion's communication of the needs and provide an appropriate Auxiliary Aid allows effective Service which for or communication between the Patient or Companion and Respondent. The extent of the evaluation necessary to comply with the terms of this Agreement shall be based on the communication needs and methods of the individual Patient or Companion. In order to effectively evaluate the needs of the Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing, Respondent shall engage in an interactive process and consult with the Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing to determine what type of Auxiliary Aid or Service is needed to ensure effective communication. ultimate decision what However, as to the

- circumstances outlined in paragraphs the 6. In VIII(5)(A)-(B) above, Respondent shall presume that an ineffective Qualified Interpreter is necessary for communication with a Patient or Companion who relies upon such Auxiliary Aids or Services. The presumption requiring an inand similar Interpreter in the above Qualified person situations may be overcome when the thorough as part of evaluation process undertaken with the Patient or Companion, determination as required by the Respondent makes Agreement that another Auxiliary Aid or Service, including VRI, is appropriate and effective to communicate with the Patient or Companion.
 - 7. Video Remote Interpreting ("VRI").

2

3

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- A. When using VRI services, Respondent shall ensure the VRI service used provides:
 - i. Real-time, full-motion video and audio over
 a high-speed, wide-bandwidth video
 connection or wireless connection that
 delivers high-quality video images that do
 not produce lags, choppy, blurry, or grainy

JUB

images, or irregular pauses in
communication;

- ii. A sharply delineated image that is large enough to display the interpreter's face, arms, hands, and fingers, and the participating individual's face, arms, hands, and fingers, regardless of his or her body position;
- iii. A clear, audible transmission of voices;
 and
- iv. Adequate training to users of the technology and other involved individuals so that they may quickly and efficiently set up and operate the VRI.
- VRI shall not be used when it is not effective, В. for example, due to: (1) a patient's limited ability to move his or her head, hands or arms; vision or cognitive issues; or significant pain; space limitations in the room; (3) complexity of the medical or psychological issue or issues; or (4) any other time when there are indicators that VRI is not providing effective communication with a Patient or Companion. Whenever, based on the circumstances, VRI does effective communication with provide Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of



15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Hearing (after VRI has been provided or is not be VRI shall not used available), for in-person Qualified substitute an in-person Qualified Interpreter, and an be provided by Respondent. Interpreter shall When determined to be necessary by Respondent as result of the thorough evaluation of Patient or Companion's communication needs part of the interactive process with the Patient or Companion, an in-person Qualified Interpreter shall be requested and provided in a timely manner as required by the provisions of this Agreement; timeliness being considered from the time it becomes evident that VRI cannot provide effective communication.

Respondent shall not rely on an adult friend or 8. family member of the Patient or Companion who is Deaf or Hard of Hearing to interpret except: (a) in an emergency involving an imminent threat to the safety of an individual or the public where there is no interpreter available; (b) where the is Deaf or Hard of Hearing Companion who Patient orspecifically requests that the adult friend or adult family member interpret, the accompanying adult agrees to provide such assistance, and reliance on that adult for such assistance is appropriate under the circumstances. Respondent shall not rely on a minor child to interpret except in an emergency involving



an imminent threat to the safety of an individual or the public where there is no interpreter available.

9. All appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services required by this Agreement will be provided free of charge to Patients and Companions who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing.

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

XX

- 1. Within sixty (60) days of the effective date of this Agreement and for all new hire managers and staff members who have contact with patients, Respondent agrees that each of their owners, managers, and staff members who have contact with patients shall receive training regarding Respondent's policy, as outlined in this Agreement, for providing appropriate Auxiliary Aids and Services that are necessary for effective communication as well as requirements of the Arizonans with Disabilities Act and Americans with Disabilities Act.
- The training will address the needs of Patients and 2. Companions who are Deaf or Hard of Hearing and will include the promptly identify following objectives: (a) how to communication needs of Patients and Companions who are Deaf or Hearing, including when an in-person Qualified Hard of Interpreter is necessary and when VRI or other Auxiliary Aids and Services are appropriate and effective; (b) how to secure Qualified Interpreter services or VRI services as quickly as possible when necessary; (c) how to use, when appropriate, flash cards and/or pictographs in conjunction with any other of communication that will augment the available means

SNB

12

AZDA

effectiveness of the communication; (d) how and when to use VRI services, including how to make and receive calls; and (e) the requirements of this Agreement including, but not limited to, the requirements as outlined in section VIII.

5

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Such training may be held at the Respondent's typical 3. place of business or any other location, including online or computer based training. A Qualified Trainer shall conduct the training. For purposes of this Agreement, a Qualified Trainer is a person or agency that is knowledgeable about the legal requirements under state and federal disability laws and was not one of Respondent's employees involved in the acts alleged as discriminatory by the Complainants. The training shall If there are consist of at least one hour of instruction. costs associated with training, Respondent shall pay those costs. Within ten (10) days of the completion of the training, Respondent agrees to provide written notice to the Division that it has complied with the terms of this paragraph. Respondent agrees that the written notice will contain at a minimum the following: (1) confirmation that the training occurred; (2) the date, time and location of the training(s); (3) a list of the names and positions of those persons who attended the training(s); and (4) a plan to train new personnel in the future. Respondent may satisfy the requirement of identifying the attendees by attaching a copy of a registration list that includes the printed name and position of the person registering his/her attendance.

SNB

2

3

Ę.

6

g

9

10

11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

23

22

24 25

26

The parties also agree to the following:

Respondent has agreed to pay Complainants the sum of 1. forty thousand dollars (\$40,000) as a settlement for the matters that were alleged in the charge of discrimination numbered CRD No. PCRD-2018-0346. Respondent agrees to pay the settlement within ten (10) days of the effective date of this Agreement. Respondent will write one check to Isabela Choi for dollars(\$32,000) and one check to The thirty-two thousand Foster Group PLLC for (\$8,000), the amounts of the two checks in total being the agreed upon financial settlement of forty thousand dollars (\$40,000). The Complainants and Respondent Private Confidential Settlement execute a have agreed to Agreement and Release of which the Division is not a party. The terms of the Private Confidential Settlement Agreement and Release, other than the settlement amount of forty thousand dollars (\$40,000), are not known to the Division. The financial terms of the Private Settlement Agreement as far as they are reflected in this Agreement may be made public if the Attorney General determines that disclosure would further the purposes Rights Act the Arizonans of the Arizona Civil orThe parties acknowledge the Division does Disabilities Act. not agree to be responsible for enforcement of the Private Settlement Agreement the and Release which Confidential Division is not a party to.

JMB.

- 1. Within ten (10) days of the effective date of this Agreement, Respondent agrees to: (1) provide a copy of the new policy to any and all employees; and (2) post and maintain the new Policy in a prominent location at Respondent's places of business.
- 2. Each new employee hired by Respondent after the effective date of this Agreement shall receive a copy of the Policy and receive training pursuant to the Agreement.

XT

This Agreement constitutes the entire Agreement between the Complainants, Respondent and the Division.

XII

Respondent agrees to confirm to the Division in writing that it is in compliance with the terms and conditions of this Agreement within ten (10) business days after satisfaction of each obligation. The requirement of a writing may be satisfied by mail to Daniel Nies 2005 N. Central Ave., Phoenix, AZ 85004 or by email to Daniel Nies at Daniel Nies@azag.gov.

IIIX

Complainant and Respondent agree to pay their own Attorneys' fees, if any.

XIV

This Agreement will not become effective until it has been reviewed and signed by a Division representative.

ΧV

ZNB

This Agreement may be executed in two or more counterparts, each of which will be deemed an original and together form one Agreement. Facsimiles and pdf versions of this signed Agreement shall be deemed to be originals.

IVX

The parties represent that they have read this Agreement in its entirety, have had an opportunity to consult with counsel of their own choice, are satisfied that they understand and agree to all of its provisions, and have freely signed this Agreement without coercion.

XVII

Each party (or person signing on behalf of a party) to this Agreement warrants and represents that they are duly and property authorized to enter into this Agreement and that all necessary approvals have been obtained prior to the execution of this Agreement.

IIIVX

This Agreement will be binding on the heirs, assigns, successors, successors-in-interest, receivers, trustees in bankruptcy, and personal representatives of the parties hereto.

XIX

This Agreement may be made public if the Attorney General determines that disclosure would further the purposes

5 Mb

1	of the Arizona Civil Righ	ts Act or the Arizonans with
2	Disabilities Act.	
3		
4		
5	10/25/19	By Donny Mary
6	/ Date/ /	Sonny Maung Complainant
7		
8		
9	10/25/19	By Ope Olile Chi
10	/ Date	Isabela Choi Complainant
11		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
12	*	Bayless Health Care, an Arizona Corporation d/b/a/ Bayless
14		Integrated Healthcare
15	1	
16	10/7/2019	By Justin Bayless
17		President and CEO Respondent
18		, nospondeneo
19	·	STATE OF ARIZONA OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL
20		CIVIL RIGHTS DIVISION
21		// m/20/
22	10/25/2019	By Acute Daniel E. Nies
23	Date	Assistant Attorney General
24		2005 N Central Ave. Phoenix, Arizona 85004
25		

JMB

26

Executed copy mailed this 25 1 day of October, 2019, to: Sonny Maung and Isabela Choi 3 3905 East Wyatt Way Gilbert, AZ 85297 Complainants 5 Justin Bayless President and CEO Bayless Health Care d/b/a Bayless Integrated Healthcare 3101 N Central Ave Suite 550 Phoenix, AZ 85012 Mesa, AZ 85202 8 Respondent 9 10 Annette Sexton-Ruiz 11 12 13 14 15 16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

JMB